

Resilient Megacities: Strategy, Security, and Sustainability

Findings from the Megacity Security Conference
in Mumbai, India, in November 2015

DECEMBER 2016

BHARATH GOPALASWAMY
AND BEN POLSKY

Preface by The Honorable Tom Ridge

Chairman, Ridge Global; Former Secretary of the US Department of Homeland Security

We live in an increasingly connected and urbanized world; societies have never been closer to reaching the apex of a globalized, hyper-connected environment. Cities are—and will continue to be—the arenas where the true synergy between population density, economic development, and connectivity is seen, but not without bearing witness to significant challenges throughout the process. An estimated 54 percent of the world’s population now live in cities. This figure is expected to increase to 65 percent by 2050.¹ The international community and key global economic actors cannot ignore the drastic implications—and sheer benefits—behind this rapid rate of urbanization. If security, health, and education within the urban context are addressed correctly and effectively, populations in major cities will have unprecedented potential to be efficient, progressive, and sustainable engines of the global economy. Connectivity, economic security, and proper administrative progress are crucial to realizing this potential.

With seven of the highest-populated megacities in the world, Asia boasts the largest, most urbanized economic bloc on the planet.² Continued migrant flows from rural to urban environs will place more and more pressure on infrastructure and security in these megacities, five of which are in South Asia—Delhi, Mumbai, Dhaka, Calcutta, and Karachi. However, the concentration of such populations also stands to yield significant benefits for sustainable economic growth and international cooperation.

The Atlantic Council’s South Asia Center is a solution oriented program focused on the practical promotion of peace and cooperation in the South Asia region and its periphery. The Center is committed to producing innovative ideas and actions that “wage peace” in South Asia.

- 1 United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs, “World’s population increasingly urban with more than half living in urban areas,” DESA Newsletter, July 10, 2014, <http://www.un.org/en/development/desa/news/population/world-urbanization-prospects-2014.html>.
- 2 Nick Warelis, “Smart Business in Smart Cities,” *CSR Asia-Weekly*, May 4, 2016, <http://csr-asia.com/csr-asia-weekly-news-detail.php?id=12580>.

Resilient Megacities: Strategy, Security, and Sustainability

Major urban administrations have been partnering to act on climate change challenges—the most significant partnership being the C40 Cities Climate Leadership Group, which brings together municipal leaders across the globe to solve various urban-based barriers to climate change and promote sustainability in their urban communities.³

Beyond climate partnership, megacities will profit from enhanced regional infrastructure development, as well as physical and virtual connectivity. High-speed rail, for example, will reduce road traffic and air travel and lead to significant carbon emission cuts. Transit infrastructure notwithstanding, cities have immense potential for enabling communities with Internet and broadband connectivity.⁴ Economic sustainability can only be improved through connectivity technology in dense megacity sectors—provided that proper security measures are implemented to prevent such technology from being misused by malevolent actors.

In these ways, megacities serve to amplify the impact of economic investment throughout their regions; foreign direct investment in the United States, Germany, and India is concentrated in one or two main cities in their respective countries.⁵

It is crucial, however, that municipal administrations place security at the forefront of their urbanization

strategies. Building resiliency and accessibility are paramount to ensuring that megacities remain positive and sustainable locales on the global stage. Intelligence networks and surveillance strategies need to be bolstered in the face of increasing urbanization that will inevitably lend itself to harboring violent non-state actors who skillfully sheathe themselves within the fabric of urban vicinities. Security operations in megacities need to be improved if such benefits from urbanization are to be seen.⁶

The following white paper offers practical prescriptions for how megacities can and should proceed in balancing the costs and benefits associated with hyper-connected and economically integrated urban societies. Forging international cooperation to confront transnational threats, promoting public-private partnerships, and fostering social inclusivity are three major milestones that need to be met for megacity administrations going forward. International cooperation on transnational threats and countering violent non-state actors is crucial for securing these urban centers, so as to promote sustained economic growth and action on critical development challenges, including climate change and urban health. On a more micro scale, social inclusivity needs to be promoted to ensure that radicalization and violent extremism do not take root across vast urban societies. Finally, public-private partnerships will enhance long-term economic development efforts and ensure megacities can maximize the global economy's potential in an increasingly connected and globalized world.

3 C40 Blog, "C40 Launches New Report Showcasing Obstacles and Solutions to Climate Actions in Cities," C40 Cities, May 5, 2016, http://www.c40.org/blog_posts/c40-launches-new-report-showcasing-obstacles-and-solutions-to-climate-action-in-cities.

4 ICT Data and Statistics Division, "ICT Facts & Figures-The World in 2015," May 2015, <https://www.itu.int/en/ITU-D/Statistics/Documents/facts/ICTFactsFigures2015.pdf>.

5 Michele Acuto and Parag Khanna, "Nations are no longer driving globalization—cities are," May 3, 2013, <http://qz.com/80657/the-return-of-the-city-state/>.

6 Chad Serena and Colin Clarke, "Commentary: A new kind of battlefield awaits the U.S. military-megacities," *Reuters-Blog*, April, 8, 2016, <http://www.reuters.com/article/usa-commentary-megacities-idUSKCN0X52B2>.

Megacities are experiencing massive and rapid urbanization, fueled by the inflow of immigrants and rural youth. Fifty-four percent of the world's population lives in cities, and that number is expected to rise to 80 percent in the developing world by 2030.⁷ Under the pressures of such dramatic societal shifts, administering megacities is an increasingly demanding task for local governments.

High unemployment is of particular concern for local governments in megacities, as lack of opportunity often leads people to adopt criminal and dangerous lifestyles.⁸ In India alone, the 2011 census reported that nearly 65.5 million Indians live in urban slums, with 13.7 percent of the urban population living below the national poverty line.⁹ Infrastructural, environmental, and socioeconomic problems that threaten megacities around the world translate into security threats that affect local and global communities alike.¹⁰

Recent attacks in megacities such as Mumbai and Istanbul, and in large cities such as Brussels, Lahore, Paris, Boston, and Nairobi vividly illustrate the security challenges that cities face in the twenty-first century. The threat that terrorism poses today is a challenge that confounds all conventional approaches to national security. In order to adequately confront the threats megacities face, local public sector, private sector, and civil society actors must engage in counterterrorism strategizing through coordinated and multilateral approaches with international partners.

In today's globalized world, people are more connected than at any other point in history. Such interconnectivity affords enormous opportunity but also presents serious security challenges to our institutions and to public

safety. International networks are fueling terrorist activity through financial, logistical, and operational support. The attackers that perpetrated the Brussels attacks moved through Europe's porous borders and were able to evade the intelligence community in Europe who failed to ascertain their threat, even in light of Turkish warnings.¹¹ The attackers in Brussels and Paris were equipped with the resources of the Islamic State of Iraq and al-Sham (ISIS), demonstrating the global reach of an organization with roots in the Middle East. ISIS itself receives funds from as many as forty countries and includes twenty-five thousand foreign fighters.¹² Terrorism's transnational nature—the illegal movement of arms, people, goods, money, and extremist ideology across national borders—means that any effective security response undertaken by one city must include others.¹³

Ultimately, the manner in which authorities confront terrorism has consequences that can reverberate across populations and exacerbate the very social, ethnic, religious, and, ultimately, political tensions that feed terrorism in the first place. Immediately following a terrorist attack, judicial and governmental bodies have to temper their responses to avoid pursuing illegitimate, unconstitutional, or illegal means of locating perpetrators of terrorist attacks and enforcing stability.¹⁴

To address the many complex challenges confronting megacities, the Atlantic Council and US Consulate General in Mumbai, with support from the India Foundation, organized the Megacity Security Conference, a two-day event held in November 2015, with the following objectives:

1. **To create a global network of practitioners and thinkers working on megacity security matters.**

The conference laid the foundations for new, lasting relationships between individuals and institutions in the United States, India, and the rest of the world working on issues related to megacity security.

7 Katherine Purvis, "2015 Challenges: Urbanisation," *Guardian*, March 26, 2015, <http://www.theguardian.com/global-development-professionals-network/2015/mar/26/2015-challenges-urbanisation>.

8 "Urbanisation: Our Biggest Challenge and Our Greatest Opportunity," The Global Network of Cities, Local and Regional Governments, May 19, 2015, <http://www.uclg.org/en/media/news/urbanisation-our-biggest-challenge-and-our-greatest-opportunity>.

9 "Indian Cities Can Take More Advantage of Urbanization for Economic Growth," World Bank Group, September 24, 2015, <http://www.worldbank.org/en/news/press-release/2015/09/24/indian-cities-can-take-more-advantage-urbanization-for-economic-growth>.

10 Mathew Burrows, *The Future, Declassified: Megatrends That Will Undo the World Unless We Take Action* (London: St. Martin's Press, 2014); P. H. Liotta and James F. Miskel, *The Real Population Bomb: Megacities, Global Security and the Map of the Future* (Sterling, VA: Potomac Books, 2012).

11 David Dolan, "Turkey Says Brussels Attacker Deported in 2015, Belgium Ignored Warning," Reuters, March 23, 2016, <http://www.reuters.com/article/us-belgium-blast-turkey-idUSKCNOWP2C8>.

12 Radio Free Europe, "Foreign Fighters in Iraq and Syria," November 20, 2015, <http://www.rferl.org/content/infographics/foreign-fighters-syria-iraq-is-isis-isil-infographic/26584940.html>.

13 Anthony Cordesman, *International Cooperation in Counterterrorism: Redefining the Threat and the Requirement* (Washington, DC: Center for Strategic and International Studies, 2010).

14 *Meeting the Challenges of Megacities in the Developing World: A Collection of Working Papers* (Washington, DC: National Research Council, 1996).

2. **To establish a forum to educate and inform relevant stakeholders.** Stakeholders included policymakers; business leaders; media representatives; public servants in law enforcement agencies, such as the police and intelligence bureaus; and lawyers in the criminal justice system.
3. **To produce practical policy recommendations** with an aim to improve US-India and broader global cooperation in confronting megacity security challenges.

Thematically, the conference addressed the following topic areas:

- **Strategy, Security, and Sustainability:** Participants engaged in a dialogue on safeguarding infrastructure, industries, and societal cohesion that are critical to securing the core interests of megacity and homeland security. The conversation informed the international stakeholders in attendance—from Kenya, Turkey, Bangladesh, Mexico, Philippines, United Kingdom, India, and the United States—about the others’ threat environments and their security responses to these threats, highlighting unique problems and innovative local solutions. There was consensus across the participants that a security threat to one city presents security threats to all. As Ambassador Martin Kimani, Director of Kenya’s National Counterterrorism Center, remarked, “My urban terrorist is yours as well.”¹⁵
- **Information and Technology:** Rapid developments in and wide distribution of technology have revolutionized the demands of counterinsurgency and counterintelligence. Terrorist groups today use the Internet and other forms of long-range wireless communications to spread their ideological propaganda as well as orders and intelligence across national borders. The 2013 Boston marathon

bombing demonstrated how communications online facilitated the self-organization of the perpetrators. The use of social media further complicates government responses to terrorist threats, making it possible for people to create narratives that challenge official press and media agencies in the event of a terrorist attack, spreading misinformation and fear. For example, the 2008 Mumbai attacks were followed by an initial lack of clarity surrounding the identities of the perpetrators. This obfuscation made it difficult to hold the perpetrators legally accountable and link them conclusively to the terrorist group Lashkar e-Taiba. The Megacity Security Conference marshalled expert opinion in these new domains of counterinsurgency to formulate effective antiterrorism policy in this burgeoning technological landscape.

The Megacity Security Conference marshalled expert opinion in these new domains of counterinsurgency to formulate effective antiterrorism policy in this burgeoning technological landscape.

- **Values in Security Policy:** Democracies must critically examine their values and interests to understand what policies and actions must be taken to secure them. Democracies around the world share the vision of safeguarding the core values of liberty, justice, and sovereignty. Today, terrorism and inequality pose serious threats to these core values. Forming effective policies and creating institutions that address this threat while safeguarding these values is both the critical challenge and responsibility of the democratic governments around the world.. As former Deputy Secretary of US Homeland Security Jane Holl Lute acknowledged at the conference, “We’ve got to cope

with the problems of terrorism but giving up the fundamental freedoms of my country will not be the answer.”¹⁶ The US-India Counterterrorism Cooperation Initiative, which was signed in July 2010, outlined a range of areas for cooperation, including maritime security, forensics training, investigative assistance, money laundering prevention, and mass transit security.¹⁷ This initiative is one example of existing

15 Ambassador Martin Kimani, “Session One-Cities: Strategy, Security, and Sustainability,” Atlantic Council Megacity Security Conference, Mumbai, India, November 23, 2015.

16 The Hon. Jane Holl Lute, “Megacity Security,” Atlantic Council Megacity Security Conference, Mumbai, India, November 23, 2015.

17 Sahibzada Amer Latif, “US-India Counterterrorism Cooperation: Deepening the Partnership,” statement before the House Committee on Foreign Affairs Subcommittee on Terrorism and Nonproliferation and Trade, September 14, 2011.



Ms. Suhasini Haidar, Strategic & Diplomatic Affairs Editor at *The Hindu*, speaks on a panel regarding the media's role in safeguarding megacities and the lessons learned from the 2008 Mumbai attacks with co-panelists Mr. Nitin Gokhale, Security & Strategic Affairs Editor, New Delhi Television Limited (NDTV), Mr. Yaroslav Trofimov, Senior Correspondent, *Wall Street Journal*, and Yaroslav Trofimov and Mr. Sushant Singh, Correspondent, *Indian Express*.

bilateral projects that support national security in the current context of threats from terror groups. The conference brought to the fore the necessity for value-driven counterterrorism, and experts discussed areas for joint coordination between the United States and India.

- **Policing Measures:** Maintaining security in megacities requires a security apparatus that is connected to both the national security establishment, which feeds local police intelligence, and on-the-ground, grassroots intelligence-gathering efforts.¹⁸ Participants agreed that the security chain must include a “common database” and “community engagement programs.”¹⁹ Ultimately, the most critical policing measure is vigilance in the face of uncertainty.

All four of these areas are interconnected; progress in one area positively impacts progress in the others. Taking a holistic approach to counterterrorism efforts involves developing solutions that incorporate recommendations from experts in all four fields.

The conference's participants concluded that the most daunting challenges confronting megacities include the following:

Inclusivity

Cities continue to absorb waves of immigrants in search of better opportunities, but they are largely excluded from the “life of a city.”²⁰ Hundreds of millions of immigrants around the world are not integrated into the economic, social, and political life of the cities in which they dwell. Apart from being a source of chronic grievances, the lack of access to education, vocational services, healthcare, and jobs relegates individuals

18 Dr. Rohan Gunaratna, “Megacity Security,” Atlantic Council Megacity Security Conference, Mumbai, India, November 23, 2015.

19 Ibid.

20 As defined by conference participants.

to the informal economy. This lack of inclusivity and integration often results in cities being unable to realize their full economic potential and deteriorates social cohesion, ultimately causing increases in crime and terrorism.

Sustainability

A widely acknowledged definition of the “success of a megacity” is measured in terms of its economic productivity, social equity, and environmental diversity.²¹ That said, the consequence of success is often an increase in population, which puts an ever greater strain on the environment and infrastructure in place. A key challenge facing policy managers is coping with the increasing ecological footprint of a megacity.²²

Resiliency

While crafting sustainable models of energy, infrastructure, and organization, a successful city must also build resiliency for when these models are challenged by natural or man-made shocks. Natural shocks include earthquakes, floods, storms, and other environmental disasters, which have the potential to place undue pressure on a city’s infrastructure and resources.²³ Terrorism and crime are forms of man-made shocks that have the ability to undermine state authority and state power if the city is found unprepared. Cities must prepare for all of these emergencies and build resilience. Cities require advanced technologies, strong institutions, and innovative perspectives to identify weak points and continuously work toward achieving a higher degree of resiliency.

Governance

Rapid urbanization presents policy managers with a unique set of governance challenges. At a conceptual level, the question that academics, policymakers, and practitioners ponder is the extent to which megacity governments are integrated with global governance institutions such as the United Nations. At a practical level, the challenges that often confront practitioners range from navigating institutional complexity;

addressing weaknesses in the management, delivery, and allocation of public resources; and understanding the role of private actors and the relationship between the city, state, and federal government.

To address these challenges, the participants made the following recommendations:

Accept the Rapid Pace of Urbanization

Policy managers must acknowledge the rapid pace of urbanization and come to terms with this reality as more and more people move to cities in search of better economic opportunities.²⁴ In 2014, more than 3.3 billion people resided in urban areas, and many projections estimate that the world will have an urbanization rate of 60 percent by 2030.²⁵ The incredibly rapid pace of urbanization will exacerbate social, economic, and political problems, amounting to what experts say is an urban tipping point—a moment when social process and urbanization in megacities acquires the potential for transition from conflict to outright violence.²⁶ Policy managers must be increasingly aware of and technically equipped to confront these challenges to keep conflict from erupting and to maintain the political processes that allow for inclusive governance.

Forge Greater International Cooperation to Confront the Transnational Nature of Threats

City and national security managers are increasingly cognizant of the transnational threat of terrorism. Attacks are often planned elsewhere, such as the 2015 Paris attacks, the 2008 Mumbai attacks, and the 9/11 attacks in the United States. To confront these security challenges, greater international cooperation is required.²⁷

The following steps should be taken to improve international cooperation:

21 Ibid.

22 Ajah Ekpeni Obia, “Emerging Nigerian Megacities and Sustainable Development: Case Study of Lagos and Abuja,” *Journal of Sustainable Development*, vol. 9, no. 2, 2016.

23 Shruti Ravindran, “Mumbai Will Likely Flood Again—and Nobody’s Doing Much about It,” *Guardian*, November 27, 2014, http://www.theguardian.com/cities/2014/nov/27/mumbai-flood-rain-monsoon-city-planning?CMP=oth_b-aplnews_d-1.

24 *Megacities: Our Global Urban Future* (Netherlands: Earth Sciences for Society Foundation, 2005), <http://yearofplanetearth.org/content/downloads/Megacities.pdf>.

25 “World’s Population Increasingly Urban with More Than Half Living in Urban Areas,” United Nations, July 10, 2014, <http://www.un.org/en/development/desa/news/population/world-urbanization-prospects-2014.html>.

26 Caroline Moset and Dennis Rodgers, *Understanding the Tipping Point of Urban Conflict: Global Policy Report* (Manchester: University of Manchester, Urban Tipping Point project, 2012), <http://siteresources.worldbank.org/EXTGOVACC/Resources/GlobalPolicyReport.pdf>.

27 Cordesman, *International Cooperation in Counterterrorism*, op. cit.

Resilient Megacities: Strategy, Security, and Sustainability

- All parties must reach an agreement on what constitutes terrorism. Past attempts to reach a standard definition in the United Nations have failed.²⁸
- All megacities should engage with international platforms to jointly confront shared threats. Such forums for international cooperation include the Strong Cities Network, C40 Cities Climate Leadership Group, and Local Governments for Sustainability.²⁹
- Cities as well as states should engage in active and regular intelligence sharing.
- All cities must ensure that they are equipped with adequate resources to confront security challenges emanating from terrorist threats.

Build City-to-City Partnerships

Cities are increasingly engaging in their own forms of diplomacy. Cities are connected with the rest of the world through trade relations and bilateral agreements of various kinds. Cities are also creating their own multilateral forums: a key example is the C40 Cities Climate Leadership Group, which brings together the world's megacities on a mission to curb greenhouse gas emissions and to address risks posed by climate change. Composed of eighty-three member cities around the world, it aims to demonstrate that cities can play a significant role in reducing greenhouse gas emissions.

While the idea of city-to-city partnerships is not new, their necessity has never been greater. City-to-city partnerships in the form of sister-city partnerships became popular in the 1950s and 1960s. Aiming to foster reconciliation, progress, and development after World War II, cities pursued twinning arrangements through educational and cultural linkages. Globalization, which has spurred the world's economic growth, has been a key driver for increasing trade flows between regions and has also been a root cause of the growth of cities. Globalization and urbanization have opened up new markets, intensifying and complicating global supply chains. It is therefore important for cities to engage more deeply with one another to leverage their

assets and identify opportunities for collaboration. It is essential for city leaders to learn from each other by sharing their concerns and challenges and working together to identify mutually beneficial solutions.

Foster Social Cohesion and Inclusivity

“Social cohesion,” much like “integration” and “stakeholders,” is a highly contextual term and its definition varies from city to city. Analysts and scholars widely concur that the riots that followed the electrocution of two teenagers, who were hiding from the police in a power substation, in October 2005 in a French suburb were the result, in part, of a lack of social cohesion in French society. Similar riots have occurred in other European cities, which suffer from the same problem of inadequate social cohesion. Societal alienation and disenchantment are often found in areas that are characterized by poverty, high levels of unemployment, and overcrowded households where living conditions are desperate.

To overcome this problem, participants highlighted the need for better access to education and labor markets. They also stressed the need to form a collective identity aimed at large-scale integration into society. Participants agreed that such initiatives must be community-driven but facilitated by the authorities. Most importantly, participants suggested that helping local communities shift toward entrepreneurial and managerial modes of action, financing, and organizing are the best measures to address problems of social cohesion in a society.

Promote Stronger Public-Private Partnerships and Embrace the Role of Technology

Historically, improvements in software technology, such as in the fields of artificial intelligence and data systems, have played the role of force optimizer. Today, the primary concern for security agencies and national security managers is the ability—or lack thereof—to incorporate these advancements into their current systems. Thus, the next era of force optimization may come from improvements in hardware technologies.

Conference participants suggested that the direction of technology integration into security policy will be defined by the issue of privacy. Increasingly, government agencies will face legal issues linked to incorporating advances in technology into surveillance or policing programs.

28 Mr. Manish Sharma, “Session Three—Megacity Security,” Atlantic Council Megacity Security Conference, Mumbai, India, November 23, 2015.

29 Dr. Ian Klaus, “Session Two—Envisioning Megacity Futures,” Atlantic Council Megacity Security Conference, Mumbai, India, November 23, 2015.

Resilient Megacities: Strategy, Security, and Sustainability

Participants addressed the role of private companies in developing, innovating, and monitoring technologies aimed at addressing the challenges of megacity security. They underscored the partnership required between private and public sectors to improve implementation and management of such solutions.

Understand the Role of the Media

The “ubiquity of media” presents challenges to the policing community that seeks to protect megacities.³⁰ As a result, a somewhat adversarial relationship has existed between the media and police force. According to participants, in the fallout of a terrorist attack or political scandal, the media aim to expose the cause of a security breach or incident, whereas the police aim to conceal its intelligence and operational failures.

Participants suggested that media organizations should compose and share official policies during emergencies, both in terms of outlining steps to be taken to ensure the safety of their personnel and the vetting processes used for the content included in their reporting.

Analysts worldwide acknowledge that security problems accompany the widespread use of social media in particular. Both the state and the public face difficulties differentiating facts from fiction on social media outlets. However challenging to accomplish, the participants acknowledged that the authorities must have some degree of control over the narrative during traumatic times, such as during terrorist attacks. Accuracy must trump the need to report first on an incident. Inaccurate and faulty reporting negatively effects law enforcement agencies’ ability to address the security situation. Participants pointed out that mechanisms aimed at coordinating responses to crises are almost nonexistent within the media and suggested that the media start thinking about instituting such practices.

The participants called for a framework to facilitate trust between the media and government authorities. Such a framework would include a platform for a more deliberate dialogue to take place. Finally, participants underscored the need for introspection on the part of all agencies involved in public safety—be it homeland security or the media.

³⁰ Ambassador Martin Kimani, “Session One-Cities: Strategy, Security, and Sustainability,” Atlantic Council Megacity Security Conference, Mumbai, India, November 23, 2015.

Improve Community Policing

Participants expressed concerns about what they termed the “militarization of police.” Participants stressed the importance of reducing the militarization of the police and recommended equipping security forces with low-caliber, high-precision weapons, better suited to dealing with urban threats.

Conference participants also acknowledged the limitations of the law enforcement agencies. While technological advances can improve the effectiveness of law enforcement agencies, the latest surge of attacks in public spaces suggests a need for heightened vigilance among the citizenry and a citizen-friendly police force to ensure effectiveness. In response to attacks in Brussels and Paris, politicians across the world called for vigilance from ordinary citizens to help identify unusual or suspicious activity. Participants suggested that improved community policing could include the following:

- Existing educational frameworks and systems should be used to implement a public awareness and public education initiative to help citizens detect suspicious activity and improve knowledge about counterterrorism laws and counterterrorism activities of the police and law enforcement agencies. Such campaigns would empower citizens with the knowledge of their rights and help bridge the trust divide between the public and law enforcement.
- Members of law enforcement agencies should receive regular soft-skills and violence-mediation training.
- Whistle-blowers within local communities and law enforcement agencies should be encouraged and protected.

Conclusion

The Megacity Security Conference in Mumbai outlined key areas in developing resilient and sustainable megacities that require international attention. Stakeholders spoke at length about the challenges of societal integration, media and the access to and spread of information online, and coordination between local and international security apparatuses. As the menace of terrorism persists across the world, it is clear that further international integration and more profound engagement in counterterrorism strategizing are needed.

Resilient Megacities: Strategy, Security, and Sustainability

Further programs and conferences are necessary to facilitate the discussion on counterterrorism and the underlying issues feeding violence and instability on the world stage, to integrate and share best practices among partners, and to foster consensus on issues linked to security. Sustained discussion and the ongoing maintenance of relationships across sectors and countries are necessary to ensure the objectives outlined during this conference are met. The community established during this conference has a significant role to play in supporting city-to-city partnerships,

addressing common themes of urbanization and societal cohesion, and breaking new ground in the public-private and media-security establishment relationships.

The Atlantic Council believes it can and should help advance these goals. The authors would like to thank all participants, panelists, experts, and attendees for their active engagement on the issues examined at the Megacity Security Conference in Mumbai and look forward to future endeavors to address the most pressing security issues of the twenty-first century.

Resilient Megacities: Strategy, Security, and Sustainability

APPENDIX Conference Agenda

Session One—Cities: Strategy, Security, and Sustainability

Chair: Shri ML Kumawat, *Former Director General, Border Security Force*, Government of India

Speakers:

- Ambassador Martin Kimani, *Director*, National Counterterrorism Centre of Kenya
- Mr. Erdal Sabri Ergen, *Consul General*, Turkish Consulate in Mumbai, India
- Ambassador Waliur Rehman, *Special Advisor to the Prime Minister*, Government of Bangladesh

Session Two—Envisioning Megacity Futures

Chair: Ms. Juliana Kerr, *Director, Global Cities and Immigration*, The Chicago Council on Global Affairs

Speakers:

- Dr. Peter Engelke, *Resident Senior Fellow, Strategic Foresight Initiative, Brent Scowcroft Center on International Security*, Atlantic Council
- Dr. Ian Klaus, *Member, Policy Planning Staff*, US Department of State
- Mr. Gerardo Gonzalez, *Former Director General of Command, Control, and Communications (C4)*, Government of Mexico City
- Mr. Ted Berger, *Chief of Staff, Office of Emergency Management and Communication*, City of Chicago

Session Three—Megacity Security

Chair: The Hon. Jane Holl Lute, *President and CEO*, Council on Cyber Security

Speakers:

- Mr. Manish S. Sharma, *Inspector General*, Indian Police Service
- Dr. Rohan Gunaratna, *Professor of Security Studies*, Rajaratnam School of International Studies, Singapore
- Mr. Ravi Satkalmi, *Intelligence Research Specialist*, New York City Police Department
- Special Remarks by Ambassador Richard Verma, US Ambassador to India

Session Four—Guarding the Megacity: Policing Measures

Chair: Shri NC Padhi, *Former Secretary, Cabinet Secretariat*, Government of India

Speakers:

- Gen. Jonathan Ferdinand Miano, *Director, Directorate of Operations*, Government of Philippines
- Mr. Graeme Millar, *Former Police Officer*, London Metropolitan Police
- Mr. John Daily, *Former Police Officer*, New York Police Department

Session Five—The Role of Media in Megacities Security

Chair: Mr. Nitin Gokhale, *Security & Strategic Affairs Editor*, New Delhi Television Limited (NDTV)

Speakers:

- Mr. Yaroslav Trofimov, *Senior Correspondent, Wall Street Journal*
- Ms. Sushant Singh, *Correspondent, Indian Express*
- Ms. Suhasini Haidar, *Strategic & Diplomatic Affairs Editor, The Hindu*

Resilient Megacities: Strategy, Security, and Sustainability

Session Six-Technology and Public/Private Partnership in Megacities Security

Chair: Mr. RR Sahay, *Inspector General*, Central Industrial Security Force

Speakers:

- Mr. Jasbir Singh Solanki, *CEO*, Mahindra Special Services Group
- Mr. Jayant Kohale, *Business Leader for Smart Cities*, Larsen & Toubro Ltd.
- Commander Manish Tiwari, *National Information Security Officer*, Microsoft
- Mr. Priyanshu Singh, *Regional General Manager*, Honeywell Building Business Solutions, India

Atlantic Council Board of Directors

CHAIRMAN

*Jon M. Huntsman, Jr.

CHAIRMAN EMERITUS, INTERNATIONAL ADVISORY BOARD

Brent Scowcroft

PRESIDENT AND CEO

*Frederick Kempe

EXECUTIVE VICE CHAIRS

*Adrienne Arsht

*Stephen J. Hadley

VICE CHAIRS

*Robert J. Abernethy

*Richard W. Edelman

*C. Boyden Gray

*George Lund

*Virginia A. Mulberger

*W. DeVier Pierson

*John J. Studzinski

TREASURER

*Brian C. McK. Henderson

SECRETARY

*Walter B. Slocombe

DIRECTORS

Stéphane Abrial

Odeh Aburdene

*Peter Ackerman

Timothy D. Adams

Bertrand-Marc Allen

John R. Allen

Michael Andersson

Michael S. Ansari

Richard L. Armitage

David D. Aufhauser

Elizabeth F. Bagley

Peter Bass

*Rafic A. Bizri

Dennis C. Blair

*Thomas L. Blair

Philip M. Breedlove

Reuben E. Brigety II

Myron Brilliant

Esther Brimmer

*R. Nicholas Burns

William J. Burns

*Richard R. Burt

Michael Calvey

John E. Chapoton

Ahmed Charai

Sandra Charles

Melanie Chen

George Chopivsky

Wesley K. Clark

David W. Craig

*Ralph D. Crosby, Jr.

Nelson W. Cunningham

Ivo H. Daalder

Ankit N. Desai

*Paula J. Dobriansky

Christopher J. Dodd

Conrado Dornier

Thomas J. Egan, Jr.

*Stuart E. Eizenstat

Thomas R. Eldridge

Julie Finley

Lawrence P. Fisher, II

*Alan H. Fleischmann

*Ronald M. Freeman

Laurie S. Fulton

Courtney Geduldig

*Robert S. Gelbard

Thomas H. Glocer

*Sherri W. Goodman

Mikael Hagström

Ian Hague

Amir A. Handjani

John D. Harris, II

Frank Haun

Michael V. Hayden

Annette Heuser

Ed Holland

*Karl V. Hopkins

Robert D. Hormats

Miroslav Hornak

*Mary L. Howell

Wolfgang F. Ischinger

Reuben Jeffery, III

Joia M. Johnson

*James L. Jones, Jr.

Lawrence S. Kanarek

Stephen R. Kappes

Maria Pica Karp

Sean Kevelighan

*Zalmay M. Khalilzad

Robert M. Kimmitt

Henry A. Kissinger

Franklin D. Kramer

*Richard L. Lawson

*Jan M. Lodal

Jane Holl Lute

William J. Lynn

Izzat Majeed

Wendy W. Makins

Zaza Mamulaishvili

Mian M. Mansha

Gerardo Mato

William E. Mayer

T. Allan McArtor

John M. McHugh

Eric D.K. Melby

Franklin C. Miller

James N. Miller

*Judith A. Miller

*Alexander V. Mirtchev

Susan Molinari

Michael J. Morell

Georgette Mosbacher

Thomas R. Nides

Franco Nuschese

Joseph S. Nye

Hilda Ochoa-

Brillembourg

Sean C. O'Keefe

Ahmet M. Oren

*Ana I. Palacio

Carlos Pascual

Alan Pellegrini

David H. Petraeus

Thomas R. Pickering

Daniel B. Poneman

Daniel M. Price

Arnold L. Punaro

Robert Rangel

Thomas J. Ridge

Charles O. Rossotti

Robert O. Rowland

Harry Sachinis

Brent Scowcroft

Rajiv Shah

James G. Stavridis

Richard J.A. Steele

*Paula Stern

Robert J. Stevens

John S. Tanner

*Ellen O. Tauscher

Nathan D. Tibbits

Frances M. Townsend

Clyde C. Tuggle

Paul Twomey

Melanne Vermeer

Enzo Viscusi

Charles F. Wald

Michael F. Walsh

Mark R. Warner

Maciej Witucki

Neal S. Wolin

Mary C. Yates

Dov S. Zakheim

HONORARY DIRECTORS

David C. Acheson

Madeleine K. Albright

James A. Baker, III

Harold Brown

Frank C. Carlucci, III

Robert M. Gates

Michael G. Mullen

Leon E. Panetta

William J. Perry

Colin L. Powell

Condoleezza Rice

Edward L. Rowny

George P. Shultz

John W. Warner

William H. Webster

*Executive Committee Members
List as of December 2, 2016



The Atlantic Council is a nonpartisan organization that promotes constructive US leadership and engagement in international affairs based on the central role of the Atlantic community in meeting today's global challenges.

© 2016 The Atlantic Council of the United States. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means without permission in writing from the Atlantic Council, except in the case of brief quotations in news articles, critical articles, or reviews. Please direct inquiries to:

Atlantic Council

1030 15th Street, NW, 12th Floor,
Washington, DC 20005

(202) 463-7226, www.AtlanticCouncil.org